

Philosophy for Theology REL645

Homepage

Classes

Select Publications

Education

EGR590 Research Ethics



Cottonwood seeds in
springtime
Montgomery County,
Ohio

Diachronic Syllabus

DESCRIPTION: Philosophy is a conversation about and by means of the classics. Philosophy resists fads, although occasionally something like progress seems to occur. This course takes up one set of issues that came to a head in the twentieth-century, namely philosophy of psychology (the nature of the soul, the mind-body problem, and so on). The course uses these issues to learn philosophical resources for better doing theology. In particular, the course ends with a close examination of those theologians known as the “Wittgensteinian Thomists.”

April 30 Reprise: Philosophy of Psychology

Reading:

- Drury, Maurice O’C. "Concerning Body and Mind." In *The Danger of Words and Writings on Wittgenstein*, edited by Michael Fitzgerald David Berman, and John Hayes, 57-96. Bristol, UK: Thoemmes Press, 1996.
- Holmer, Paul L. "Wittgenstein and the Self." In *Essays on Kierkegaard and Wittgenstein*, edited by Richard H. Bell and Ronald E. Hustwit, 10-31. Wooster, OH: College of Wooster, 1978.
- Holmer, Paul. "The Grammar of Faith." In *The Grammar of the Heart*, edited by Richard H. Bell, 3-20. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row Publishers, 1988.
- Kallenberg, Brad J. "Holistic Spirituality as Witness." In *(Re)Connecting Spirituality and Social Justice; The Sider Institute for Mennonite, Wesleyan and Pietist Studies*. Messiah College, Grantham PA, 2002.
- Klagge, James C. "Wittgenstein and Neuroscience." *Synthese* 78 (1989): 319-343.

Reflection: Questions for in-class discussion of assigned essay.

For Further Study

- Phillips, D. Z. "The Dislocated Soul and Immortality." In *Recovering Religious Concepts: Closing Epistemic Divides*, 138-156: Palgrave Macmillan, 1999.
- Kallenberg, Brad J. "All Suffer the Affliction of the One: Metaphysical Holism and the Presence of the Spirit." *Christian Scholar's Review* 31, no. 2 (2002): 217-34.

April 23

Reading:

- Critical evaluation of classmate papers.

Reflection: Critical evaluation of all classmate papers. Please work hard at giving practical advice regarding ways to improve and clarify the paper.

April 16 No Class; Stander Symposium

Reflection: *****Penultimate draft of paper due **Friday, April 17** so that we may read and critique other classmate papers for in-class discussion on April 23. Please distribute via email, and kindly include Maria in the distribution.

April 2 Wittgenstein and Religion

Reading:

- Burrell, David. "The Act of Understanding: A Theory and an Analogy." In *Aquinas: God and Action*, 146-161. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1978.
- Hallett, Garth L. *Identity and Mystery in Themes of Christian Faith; Late-Wittgensteinian Perspectives*. Hampshire, UK & Burlington, VA: Ashgate, 2005.
- Phillips, D. Z. "Religious Beliefs and Language-Games." In *Wittgenstein and Religion*, edited by D. Z. Phillips, 56-78. London, UK: St. Martin's Press, 1993 [1970].
- Rogers, Katherine A. 2009. Incarnation. Paper presented at Annual Meeting of the Society for the Philosophy of Religion, Hilton Head, SC, 26-28 Feb.
- Taylor, Charles. "To Follow a Rule." In *Bourdieu; A Critical Reader*, edited by Richard Shusterman, 29-44. New York: Blackwell, 1999.

Reflection: Precise as per assigned essays.

For Further Study

- McClendon, James Wm., Jr. with Brad J. Kallenberg. "Ludwig Wittgenstein: A Christian in Philosophy." *The Scottish Journal of Theology* 51, no. 2 (1998): 131-161.
- Putnam, Hillary. "Wittgenstein on Religious Belief." In *On Community*, edited by Leroy S. Rouner, 56-75. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1991.

March 26 Fergus Kerr on Wittgenstein's "Third" Period

Reading:

- Kerr, Fergus. *"Work on Oneself": Wittgenstein's Philosophical Psychology* Institute for the Psychological Sciences Monograph Series. Arlington, VA: Psychological Sciences Press, 2008.
- Kerr, Fergus. *Theology after Wittgenstein*. Oxford, UK: Basil Blackwell, 1986, chapter 7.

Reflection: Precise as per assigned chapters.

For Further Study

- Kerr, Fergus. "How to Understand Heidegger and Wittgenstein." In *University of Dayton Department of Philosophy Colloquium*. Dayton, OH, 2004

March 19 Wittgenstein's philosophy of mind

Reading:

- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Last Writings on the Philosophy of*

Psychology. Vol. 2. *The Inner and the Outer, 1949-1951*. Translated by C. G. Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue, Edited by G. H. von Wright and Heikki Nyman. Cambridge, MA and Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1993.

- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Philosophical Investigations*. Translated by G. E. M. Anscombe, Edited by G. E. M. Anscombe and Rush Rhees. New York: Macmillan, 1953, **section xi**, Part II.

Reflection: (1) Make a case for or against the claim that on Wittgenstein's view the robot, Bandit-II, is a person. See "I'm Here to Make you feel better." (2) Make a case for or against the claim that on Wittgenstein's view, God is a person. See "To the brain, God is just another guy."

For Further Study

- Phillips, D. Z. "The Dislocated Soul and Immortality." In *Recovering Religious Concepts: Closing Epistemic Divides*, 138-156: Palgrave Macmillan, 1999.
- Holmer, Paul L. "Wittgenstein and the Self." In *Essays on Kierkegaard and Wittgenstein*, edited by Richard H. Bell and Ronald E. Hustwit, 10-31. Wooster, OH: College of Wooster, 1978 Self.

March 12 : Transubstantiation

Reading:

- Anscombe, G. E. M. "On Transubstantiation." In *Ethics, Religion and Politics*, 107-112. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1981.
- McCabe, Herbert. "Transubstantiation and the Real Presence." In *God Matters*, 116-129. London & New York: Continuum, 1987.
- Fitzpatrick, P. J. "Some Thoughts on Eucharistic Presence by G. Egner." In *God Matters*, 130-145. London & New York: Continuum, 1987.
- McCabe, Herbert. "Transubstantiation: A Reply to G. Egner." In *God Matters*, 146-154. London & New York: Continuum, 1987.
- Kerr, Fergus. "Transubstantiation after Wittgenstein." *Modern Theology* 15, no. 2 (1999): 115-130.
- McCabe, Herbert. "The Eucharist as Language." In *God Still Matters*, 123-138. London & New York: Continuum, 2002.
- McCabe, Herbert. "Eucharistic Change." In *God Still Matters*, 115-122. London & New York: Continuum, 2002.

Reflection: Précis describing the presence of Wittgenstein's method in of Anscombe, McCabe, and Kerr.

For Further Study

- NB: The entire issue of *Modern Theology* 15(2) 1999 is devoted to various theological accounts of Eucharist.

March 5 Wittgenstein's method

Reading:

- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Philosophical Investigations*. Translated by G. E. M. Anscombe, Edited by G. E. M. Anscombe and Rush Rhees. New York: Macmillan, 1953, §§1-188.
- _____. *On Certainty*. Translated by Denis Paul and G. E. M. Anscombe, Edited by G. E. M. Anscombe and G. H. von Wright. New York, NY: Harper Torchbooks, 1972, §§1-215.
- Holmer, Paul L. "Learning to Theologise." In *Wittgenstein : Attention to Particulars : Essays in Honour of Rush Rhees (1905-89)*, edited by D. Z. Phillips, 194-200. New York and Frankfurt am Main: St. Martin's Press and Suhrkamp, 1989.

Reflection: Paul Holmer attempts to do his work in a Wittgensteinian grid. How so? Compare what you are learning about Wittgenstein through this week's readings (in PI §§1-188 and OC §§1-215) to what you detect of Holmer's methods. (Bonus if you can spot what seems to be *missing* in Holmer's approach; this also makes him Wittgensteinian!)

February 24 (Tuesday, 3-5:30): Introduction to Wittgenstein

Reading:

- Kallenberg, *Ethics as Grammar*, chapter 3.
- Kallenberg, *Ethics as Grammar*, chapter 5

Reflection: Ten questions

February 19 : NonReductive Physicalism as a theological position

Reading:

- *Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies* by Nancey Murphy

Reflection: Précis for Murphy with special attention to objections (for and against) that might be raised by Murdoch and McCabe (and Damasio, as a bonus).

For Further Study

- Searle, John R. "The Mystery of Consciousness." *The New York Review of Books* 42, no. 17 (1995): 60-66.
- Elliot, Carl. "Attitudes, Souls, and Persons: Children with Severe Neurological Impairment." In *Slow Cures and Bad Philosophers: Essays on Wittgenstein, Medicine, and Bioethics*, edited by Carl Elliot, 89-102. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2001.
- Searle, John R. "The Mystery of Consciousness: Part II." *The New York Review of Books* 42, no. 18 (1995): 54-64.
- Phillips, D. Z. "The World and 'I'." *Philosophical Investigations* 18, no. 3 (1995): 235-49.

February 12 : Supervenience and NonReductive Physicalism

Reading:

- Green, J. B. (1999). Restoring the Human Person: New Testament Voices for a Wholistic and Social Anthropology. In R. J. Russell, N. Murphy, T. C. Meyering & M. A. Arbib (Eds.), *Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action* (pp. 4-22). Vatican City State & Berkeley, CA: Vatican Observatory & CTNS.
- Savellos, E. E., & Yalçin, Ü. D. (1995). Introduction. In E. E. Savellos & Ü. D. Yalçin (Eds.), *Supervenience: New Essays* (pp. 1-15). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Kim, J. (1993). Concepts of Supervenience. In *Supervenience and Mind: Selected Philosophical Essays* (pp. 53-78). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Murphy, N. (1999). Supervenience and the Downward Efficacy of the Mental: A Nonreductive Physicalist Account of Human Action. In R. J. Russell, N. Murphy, T. C. Meyering & M. A. Arbib (Eds.), *Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action* (pp. 147-164). Vatican City State & Berkeley, CA: Vatican Observatory & CTNS.

Reflection: Précis.

For Further Study

- Kim, J. (1993). Multiple Realization and the Metaphysics of Reduction *Supervenience and Mind: Selected Philosophical Essays* (pp. 309-335). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Davidson, Donald. (1980 [1970]). Mental Events *Essays on Actions and Events* (pp. 207-225). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Putnam, Hilary. "Psychological Predicates [Subsequently Retitled As "The Nature of Mental States"]." In *Art, Mind and Religion*, edited by W. H. Capitan and D. D. Merrill, 37-48. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1967.
- Supervenience Bibliography.1998.doc

February 5 : Guest Lecture: D. B. Hart (candidate for a senior faculty position)

Reading:

- Hart, David Bentley. "The Offering Names: Metaphysics, Nihilism and Analogy." In *Reason and the Reasons of Faith*, edited by Paul J. Griffiths and Reinhard Hütter, 255-291. New York & London: T & T Clark, 2005.
- Murphy, Nancey. *Anglo-American Postmodernity* Anglo-American

Postmodernity: Philosophical Perspectives on Science, Religion, and Ethics. Boulder, CO: WestviewPress, 1997.

- Kerr, Fergus. "The Modern Philosophy of the Self in Recent Theology [Repr. Of Ch. 1, *Theology after Wittgenstein*]." In *Neuroscience and the Person: Scientific Perspectives on Divine Action*, edited by Robert John Russell, Nancey Murphy, Theo C. Meyering and Michael A. Arbib, 23-40. Vatican City State & Berkeley, CA: Vatican Observatory & CTNS, 1999.

Reflection: (1) please compose 5 questions for in-class discussion with Dr. Hart. (2) no précis are required for the other two essays.

For Further Study

- Murphy, Nancey, and Brad J. Kallenberg. "Anglo-American Postmodern Theology." In *Cambridge Companion to Postmodern Theology*, edited by Kevin J. Vanhoozer, 26-41. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Murph Nancey, and James Wm. McClendon, Jr. "Distinguishing Modern and Postmodern Theologies." *Modern Theology* 5, no. 3 (1989): 191-214.
- Sheehan, Thomas. "Reading a Life: Heidegger and Hard Times." In *The Cambridge Companion to Heidegger*, edited by Charles Guigon, 70-96. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1993.,
- Hart, Kevin. *Postmodernism: A Beginner's Guide*. Oxford, UK: OneWorld, 2006, chs 1-2.
- Kallenberg, Brad J., and Ethan Smith. "Postmodernisms." In *The Global Dictionary of Theology*, edited by Veli-Matti Karkkainen and Bill Dyrness, 568-574. Downers Grove, IN: InterVarsity Press, 2008.

January 29 Antonio Damasio

Reading:

- *Descartes' Error: Emotion, Reason, and the Human Brain*

Reflection: (1) Please focus your Damasio précis on the chapters you will lead in discussion. (2) In the constructive section of your précis, try to hypothesize answers to any questions you raise about your chapters. Remember that Damasio is neither a philosopher nor a theologian. So, we ought not fault him for any specious claims or categories. Rather, we must use his writing as sort of "data" against which we do our philosophizing and theologizing. (And your constructive forays may be either philosophical or more explicitly theological in nature.) (3) In lieu of précis for the other chapters, write single questions per chapter to be used in-class discussion.

Also for in-class discussion: Miller, Greg. "The Roots of Morality." *Science* 320 (9 May 2008): 734-737.

Paper 1 Instructions.doc

January 22 Herbert McCabe

Reading:

- *On Aquinas*
- (Students unfamiliar with Aristotle are urged to consult Encyclopedias of Philosophy and/or Wallace Matson's *A New History of Philosophy* for clarification as needed.)

Reflection: (1) What evidence do you see of Aristotle's influence, via Aquinas of course, on McCabe's thinking, especially on his conception of "the soul"? Or, how does he differ from Murdoch's conception of the soul/human life/psyche, etc.? (2) What questions do you think he leaves unanswered? (Please practice concrete attempts at philosophizing. One only can improve by trying!)

For Further Study

- McCabe, Herbert. 2002. "Eucharist as language." In *God still matters*:123-137. London & New York: Continuum.
- McCabe's more technically demanding dialogue with G. Enger on Transubstantiation in McCabe, Herbert. 2005. *God matters*: 116-181. New York: Continuum.

January 15 Iris Murdoch

Reading:

- *The Sovereignty of Good*

- (Students unfamiliar with Plato are urged to consult Encyclopedias of Philosophy and/or Wallace Matson's *A New History of Philosophy* for clarification as needed.)

Reflection: (1) What evidence do you see of Plato's influence (as per last week's lecture, etc.) on Murdoch's thinking, especially on her conception of "the Good"? (2) What questions do you think she leaves unanswered? (Please practice concrete attempts at philosophizing. One only can improve by trying!)

For Further Study:

- Murdoch, Iris. 1966. Vision and choice in morality. In *Christian ethics and contemporary philosophy*, ed. Ian T. Ramsey:195-218. New York, NY: Macmillan.
- Hauerwas, Stanley, with James Fodor. 1997. Murdochian muddles: Can we get through them if God does not exist? In *Wilderness wanderings: Probing twentieth-century theology and philosophy*:155-170. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

January 8 No class—*Society of Christian Ethics* (Chicago)

January 6, Tuesday What is "philosophical theology"

Reading:

- Murphy, Nancey. "Philosophical Theology." In *A New Handbook of Christian Theology*, edited by Donald W. Musser and Joseph L. Price, 355-9. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1992.
- S.v. "History, philosophy of" in *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy Online*. For additional treatment of topics, see Edwards, Paul, ed. *Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 4 Volumes*. New York, NY: Macmillan Press, 1967.

REQUIRED READING: in addition to photocopied articles, the following books are required reading. I urge you in the strongest possible terms to **purchase** copies of these books. Inexpensive used copies can often be tracked down from "Fetch Book" <<http://www.fetchbook.info/>>. Because our discussion of texts will be very close (for that is the nature of philosophical theology), students are urged to thoughtfully mark up their books to better prepares them for in-class discussion.

REQUIRED BOOKS

- Burrell, David B. *Knowing the Unknowable God*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1986. ISBN 0268012261
- Damasio, Antonio. *Descartes' Error: Emotion, Reason, and the Human Brain*. New York: Penguin, 2005. ISBN 014303622X
- Kerr, Fergus. *"Work on Oneself": Wittgenstein's Philosophical Psychology, Institute for the Psychological Sciences Monograph Series*. Arlington, VA: Psychological Sciences Press, 2008. ISBN 978-0977310319
- McCabe, Herbert. *God Matters*. New York: Continuum, 2005. ISBN 978-0826476685
- McCabe, Herbert. *On Aquinas*. Edited Brian Davies. London & New York: Continuum, 2007. ISBN 978-0-86012-461-0
- Murdoch, Iris. *The Sovereignty of Good*. London, UK: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970. ISBN 0415253993
- Murphy, Nancey. *Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies?* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006. ISBN 978-0521676762
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology. Vol. 2. The Inner and the Outer, 1949-1951*. Translated by C. G Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue. Edited G. H. von Wright and Heikki Nyman. Cambridge, MA and Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1993. ISBN 978-0631189565
- A Wittgensteinian Thomist of your choosing.... (TBD)

RECOMMENDED BOOKS

- Kallenberg, Brad J. *Ethics as Grammar: Changing the Postmodern Subject*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2001. ISBN 978-0268027605
- Kerr, Fergus. *Theology after Wittgenstein*. Oxford, UK: Basil Blackwell, 1986.

ISBN 978-0281050635

- Edwards, Paul, ed. *Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 4 Volumes*. New York, NY: Macmillan Press, 1967.
- Matson, Wallace I. 1999. *A New History of Philosophy, Volume II: From Descartes to Searle*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing. ISBN 978-0155078499
- Monk, Raymond. *How to Read Wittgenstein*. New York & London: W.W. Norton, 2005. ISBN 0-393-32820-1
- Monk, Ray. *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Duty of Genius*. New York: Viking Penguin, 1990. ISBN 978-0140159950
- Seech, Zachary. 2008. *Writing Philosophy Papers*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth. ISBN 978-04955068433
- Graybosch, Anthony J., Gregory M. Scott, and Stephen M. Garrison. *The Philosophy Student Writer's Manual*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1998.
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig. *Philosophical Investigations: The German Text, with a Revised English Translation 50th Anniversary Commemorative Edition*. New York: Wiley-Blackwell, 1991. ISBN 978-063123127.

ASSIGNMENTS: Philosophical theology is a language, *sui generis*. There is no way to learn it except by practicing talking. This is risky business! But remember that you are in good company; we are all still at school. Conversation is obviously more interesting when all parties have something to say. Those that do the reading and writing before class will do much better in the oral participation component of the class, worth 30%.

DOCTORAL ASSIGNMENTS

- Weekly précis (2 pp. ea.), summarizing the reading as focused by the reading question AND going beyond the reading as an attempt by the student to do constructive thinking. Cumulative value of the précis is 20%.
- Paper #1: comparison of Iris Murdoch and Herbert McCabe with respect to their concept of "the Good." Articulated process. Worth 15%.
- Paper 2.doc: Paper on an approved Wittgensteinian Thomist (e.g., Fergus Kerr, Peter Geach, Stanley Hauerwas, and perhaps even Rowan Williams, etc.). The paper must display constructive work. Worth 35%.

MASTER'S LEVEL ASSIGNMENTS

- Weekly précis (2 pp. ea.), summarizing the reading as focused by the reading question AND going beyond the reading as an attempt by the student to do constructive thinking. Cumulative value of the précis is 20%.
- Paper #1: comparison of Iris Murdoch and Herbert McCabe with respect to their concept of "the Good." Articulated process. Worth 25%.
- Paper #2: Analytical book review of an approved Wittgensteinian Thomist (e.g., Fergus Kerr, Peter Geach, Stanley Hauerwas, and perhaps even Rowan Williams, etc.). Worth 25%.