

Religious Studies 535: Varieties of Early Christianity -- with a Focus on "Apocalyptic"

[Robert Kraft](mailto:kraft@ccat.sas.upenn.edu) (kraft@ccat.sas.upenn.edu), University of Pennsylvania, Fall 2005
227 Logan Hall; tel. 215 898-5827
Instructor's [home page](#) and [2004 general class home page](#), plus pre 2004 [class home directory](#)

QuickLinks

- [Course Overview](#)
- [Weekly Focus Questions](#) (5-7, 8-11, end) and [Ancient Text Links](#)
- [Current Minutes](#) (and [previous Minutes](#)), with any [Newsflashes](#)
- [Student Book Reviews for Class](#)
- [Student Research Papers](#)
- [Current E-mail Messages](#) (and previous class [E-mail Communications](#))
- [Relevant Literature including some Reviews](#)
- [Nag Hammadi Library \[NHL\] Review \(Kraft-Timbie\)](#) (especially [section 06](#)) and expanded [Index of Names](#)
- [Harnack Project](#); [Bauer Project](#); [M.R.James Project](#)

The main objective of this course is to become acquainted with "apocalyptic" movements in early Judaism and early Christianity within the context of development of the various threads that together came to be known as "Christianity" during the formative period prior to the official recognition and consolidation as a religious option under Constantine (ca 325 CE). There will be a strong emphasis on "methodological selfconsciousness" in a historical framework -- that is, how do we know what we think we know about the period and its participants, and especially those associated with "apocalypticism"? What is meant by the use of such terminology as "apocalypse," "apocalyptic," and "apocalypticism"? Familiarity with the surviving literature and other historical artifacts from the period will be basic to the investigation, as well as an attempt to understand these materials from the perspectives of the people who originally produced them.

Requirements:

In addition to regular class attendance and participation, including assisting with class minutes/notes and attention to [email communications](#), students taking the course for credit will

- (1) submit a **research paper** (about 15 old-style pages = 5000 words) on an approved topic (choice of topic by mid-term, completed paper or full draft by the final exam period);
- (2) participate in the class **project** (electronic summaries of early texts relevant for the study of "Apocalyptic") **or** present an in-class **review** (also to be submitted in writing) of an approved modern publication on the subject; and
- (3) sit for a one-on-one comprehensive oral "**exit interview**" with the instructor (about half an hour in length) after the research paper has been evaluated and returned and all other required work is finished.

NOTE: supplementation and/or revision and resubmission of problematic work is encouraged (no penalty) when appropriate. Preliminary drafts may be submitted for the instructor's comment. Electronic submission ("text only," not attachments; or by way of your web page) is also acceptable.

Selected Primary Sources (Jewish and/or Christian) with Apocalyptic Focus:

Most of these writings have been transmitted to us through Christian filters (copied in Christian contexts, perhaps also translated or even "authored" by Christians), which sometimes have left clear traces. Since we are focusing on *Christian* apocalyptic, they are all relevant as used by Christians (except "3 Enoch"), even if of Jewish origin. convenient listings of most [early Jewish writings](#) and [early Christian writings](#), with links to other resources, have been created by Peter Kirby and are frequently referenced below.

- [Ezekiel 1](#) [Jewish scriptures] and "[pseudo-Ezekiel](#)" materials
- [The Book of Daniel](#) [Jewish scriptures] and the Daniel Cycle
 - [extracanonical] Apocalypse of Daniel [[Christianized text](#) in late Greek]
- [Enochic Apocalypse](#) or "Dream Visions" ("[1 Enoch](#)" 83-90) and the [Enoch Cycle](#)
 - "[2 Enoch](#)" [also [here](#) and [here](#); Jewish extracanonical work in Old Church Slavic]
 - "[3 Enoch](#)" [in Hebrew, preserved by classical Judaism]
- "[4 Ezra](#)" [= "2 Esdras" 3-14; Jewish extracanonical work in Latin] and the Ezra Cycle
 - [Apocalypse of Ezra](#) [Christian "late" [Greek](#)] and of [Sedrach](#) [Christian "late" [Greek](#)]
 - See also [Vision of Ezra](#), [Revelation of Ezra](#) and [Questions of Ezra](#)
- "[2 Baruch](#)" [[Jewish extracanonical work](#) in Syriac] and the Baruch Cycle
 - "[3 Baruch](#)" [[Jewish extracanonical work](#) in Greek]
 - [Paraleipomena Jeremiou](#) [= "[4 Baruch](#)"; [Christianized text](#) in [Greek](#)]
- [Apocalypse of Zephaniah](#) [[Jewish extracanonical work](#) in Coptic]
- Legend and [Apocalypse of Abraham](#) [[Jewish extracanonical work](#) in Old Church Slavic]
- [Apocalypse of Elijah](#) [[Christianized text](#) in Greek and Coptic]
- [Ascension of Isaiah](#) [also [here](#); [Christianized text](#) in Greek]
- [Apocalypse of Adam](#) [also from [Nag Hammadi](#)] and the [Adam/Eve Cycle](#)
 - "[Apocalypse of Moses](#)" [deals with [Adam/Eve](#) materials]
- [Sibylline Oracles](#) [[Christianized collection](#) and adaptation of Greco-Roman texts; poetic rendering by M.Terry; also [here](#)]
- "The Synoptic Apocalypse" in [GMk 13 and parallels](#) (New Testament)
- [Book of Revelation](#) [aka "The [Apocalypse of John](#)"] (New Testament)
 - [Another Apocalypse of John](#) [[extracanonical Christian work](#)]
- [Didache 16](#) [an [early Christian Manual](#) for conduct and worship]
- [Epistle of the Apostles](#) [Christian mixed-genre [text in Ethiopic, etc.](#)]
- [Shepherd of Hermas](#) [Christian non-eschatological apocalypse in Greek]
- [Apocalypse of Peter](#) [extracanonical [Christian work](#)]
 - [Coptic Apocalypse of Peter](#) ["gnostic" connections, found at [Nag Hammadi](#)]
- [Apocalypse of Paul](#) [extracanonical Christian work; [similar translation](#)]
 - [Coptic Apocalypse of Paul](#) ["gnostic" connections, found at [Nag Hammadi](#)]
- [First Apocalypse of Jacob/James](#) [also from [Nag Hammadi](#)]
 - [Second Apocalypse of Jacob/James](#) [also from Nag Hammadi]
- [Apocalypse of Thomas](#) [extracanonical Christian work]

Collections of Ancient Primary Sources:

(see also the larger collections in Ante-Nicene Fathers, Ancient Christian Writers, and similar series; online see especially the [Early Jewish Writings](#) page, [Early Christian Writings](#) page, the [Early Church Fathers](#) site, and the [Additional Texts](#) -- also the [Tertullian site](#))

- The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha, vol 1: Apocalyptic Literature & Testaments, ed. James H. Charlesworth (Doubleday 1983)
- [New Testament](#) [an ancient collection] (any version) [see also the [gospel parallels](#) site]
- [Apocryphal New Testament](#) [modern collection] (James or Hennecke or Elliott)

[see also the more complete [Early Christian Writings](#) website and the "[Noncanonical Literature](#)" site with their various links and subdivisions; a recent addition to this literature is Fred Lapham, *An Introduction to the NT Apocrypha: Understanding the Biblical World* (T&T Clark 2003), [reviewed](#) by Daniel M. Gurtner in RBL 2004]

- Apostolic Fathers [[modern collection](#)] (Lake/Loeb, Grant, Sparks, [patristic websites](#), etc.)
- Ehrman, *The NT and Other Early Christian Writings: A Reader* [modern anthology; Oxford 1997]
- Ehrman, *After the NT: A Reader in Early Christianity* [modern anthology; Oxford 1998]
- Mason, Steven and Tom Robinson, eds., *Early Christian Reader: Christian Texts from the First and Second Centuries in Contemporary English Translations including the New Revised Standard Version of the New Testament* [modern anthology, more limited in scope than Ehrman, but with fuller commentary; Hendrickson 2004; [reviewed](#) by Judith Anne Jones in RBL 2004]
- Richardson, [Early Christian Fathers](#) [modern anthology; Westminster 1953 (Library of Christian Classics) -- see also the [Ethereal Library](#) site]
- Stevenson, *A New Eusebius: Documents Illustrating the History of the Church to AD 337* (revised and expanded by W.H.C. Frend) [modern anthology; SPCK 1987]
- [The Nag Hammadi Library](#), and a review of [Robinson's Nag Hammadi Library](#) edition
- Note also later materials on the [Medieval Sourcebook](#) site

Modern Secondary Surveys and Syntheses (recommended for background study):

- Tyson, Joseph. *The NT and Early Christianity* [introductory, covers the period to about 180 CE; Macmillan 1984].
- Ehrman, Bart. *The NT: A Historical Introduction to the Early Christian Writings* [basic, covers the period to about 135 CE; the 2nd ed (2000) is available electronically through the [UPenn Digital Library](#), in cooperation with [Oxford Press](#)]
- Koester, Helmut. *Introduction to the NT* (2 vols) [advanced].
- Harnack, Adolph von. *Mission and Expansion of Early Christianity* (2 vols) [very valuable older source of detailed information; [electronic form](#) in process].
- Bauer, Walter (etc.). *Orthodoxy and Heresy in Earliest Christianity* [available in [electronic form](#)].
- See also the electronic copies of previous [class minutes](#)!

Anthologies of Secondary Treatments (recommended for guidance):

- [Jewish Encyclopedia](#) [c 1900, respected Reform Jewish scholarship, see "[Apocalypse](#)" and "[Apocalyptic Literature](#)"]
- *Encyclopedia Judaica* [1970s, more recent scholarly perspectives; available on CD-ROM]
- [Catholic Encyclopedia](#) [finished in 1914, useful; see "[Eschatology](#)" (no article on "Apocalyptic"!)]
- *Hastings Dictionary of Christ & the Gospels* [early 1900s, useful]
- *Hastings Dictionary of the Apostolic Church* [same]
- [Dictionary of Christian Biography](#) (ed Smith & Wace) [pre 1900, useful; see, e.g. "[Montanus](#)"]
- *Anchor Dictionary of the Bible* [recent (1992), respected]
- *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (ed. Livingstone, 1997)
- *Encyclopedia of Early Christianity* (ed. Ferguson, 1997)
- *Dictionary of Jesus and the Gospels* (ed. Green et al., 1992)
- *Dictionary of Paul and his Letters* (ed. Hawthorne et al., 1993)
- *Encyclopedia of Heresies and Heretics* (ed. Charles S. Clifton, 1992).

Overview of the Sources and their Geographical Distribution

The **Spread** of Early Christianity (see especially Bauer, [Orthodoxy](#); Harnack, [Mission 2](#)) -- see also [Maps](#) (also [here](#))

Phoenecia, Syria ([Antioch](#), [Edessa](#)), and Eastward towards India
Alexandria and [Egypt](#)
[Asia Minor](#) (Cyprus, Cilicia)
Greece ([Macedonia](#), Achaia, Illyricum)
[Rome](#) and Westward towards Gaul and Spain
North Africa

Classification of Extant Sources ([Primary](#), [Secondary](#))

Christian Literature (see especially [Goodspeed-Grant](#), Koester+)
Inscriptions and Incidental Written Remains
Evidence from Art and Archaeology
References to Christians by Others

Selected Problems Confronting Early Christianity

What Happens When the Expected End Fails to Arrive? [see [week 9](#)]

*[Paul/Paulists](#), [Montanus/Montanism](#)
[see also J. Gager, *Kingdom and Community*]

- Earliest Christianity as an Eschatological/Apocalyptic Impetus
- Frustrations, Fulfillments, and Future Hopes
- Eschatology Internalized and Institutionalized

How is Authority Constituted, Recognized, Enforced, Transmitted? [see [week 10](#)]

*Paul's [Galatians](#), the [Didache](#) (see [also](#)), [1 Clement](#) (formal letter), [Ignatius](#) (letters), [Epistle of the Apostles](#)

- Development of Authoritative Traditions > Literature (see Harnack and Bauer)
- Models of Human Leadership (Spiritual Authority, Institutional Base)
- Inclusion/Exclusion -- Struggles between Orthodoxy and Heresy (see Bauer)

Belief and Conduct in Christian Communities [see [week 11](#) and [week 12](#)]

*Johannine Epistles ([first](#), [second](#), [third](#)), Pauline Pastoral Letters([1 Timothy](#), [2 Timothy](#), [Titus](#)), [2 Clement](#) (a homily), Justin's [Apology \(and Appendix\)](#)

- From Messiah to "Christology" [see [weeks 5-8](#)]
- From Confrontations to Creedal Formulations
- From Varieties (Heterodoxy) to "Heresies"
- Communities at Worship (Heteropraxy to Orthopraxy)

Relationships to Surrounding Societies [see [week 13](#)]

*Justin's [Dialogue](#), Tatian's [Address](#), a disciple's defense to [Diognetus](#)

- From Jewish Messianism to Christian Anti-Jewishness
- From Pagan Gentiles to "the Third Race" (see Harnack 2.7)
- From Survival to a "Public Image" and Socio-Political Influence

Synthesis: Types of Varieties of Early Christianity (see [week 14](#))

- Christian Jews -- Jesus' God is Creator, Moses' Words Endure
- "Gnostic" Christians -- Alien to the Material World and its Creator
- Emerging "Mainstream" -- Preserving/Forging a Middle Ground

Focus Questions, by the week = class meeting

1a. Getting Oriented to the Sources and Terminology

Read [Felix Just's presentation](#) and at least two Encyclopedia articles on "Apocalyptic" and related terminology and be prepared to compare them. What is the difference (if any) between "eschatological" and "apocalyptic"? Identify four different **COLLECTIONS** of literature (groupings; e.g. "New Testament") containing apocalyptic material used by early Christians and be prepared to give at least one in-depth example of an apocalyptic writing or section from each. How, in general, does each collection relate to "apocalyptic" materials (if at all)?

[Suggestion: look at tables of contents of Primary Source Collections]

Further questions of definition:

- * What does the Greek word "apocalypse" mean?
- * Were there Christian critics of "apocalypticism" in the early period?
- * What are the main ideas associated with "apocalypticism" by modern scholars?

1b. To What Extent were the Earliest Followers of Joshua/Jesus "Apocalyptic"?

It is often claimed that [Joshua/Jesus](#) proclaimed the immanent end of the world in a Jewish context familiar with such ideas, and that [Paul](#) and others continued such emphases even as the "Jesus movement" spread more widely. How compelling is the evidence? Are there believable alternative interpretations? What factors that are reasonably well documented for the first century CE need to be considered in such a discussion? [Explain PERSIA headings, show how to use "concordance" type tools such as "[Bible Gateway](#)" and "[Gospel Parallels](#)."]]

Things to consider:

- * Joshua/Jesus and his earliest followers probably spoke mainly Aramaic or Hebrew.
- * The Jewish context, even in Palestine/Israel, was multifaceted.
- * Even the early Christian witnesses are not uniform in eschatological perspectives..

2. Getting Oriented to the Participants [see also 1b, above]

Identify four different **TYPES of FOCUS** within early "apocalypticism" (e.g. who is judged and how? how is information conveyed? what is the expected or desired outcome?) and be able to describe in some detail at least one ancient source that provides information on each type.

[Suggestion: work from tables of contents of Secondary Syntheses, with help from Secondary Anthologies and general definitional articles as necessary]

Further questions of identification:

- * In what ways do early "apocalyptic" groups or representatives differ from each other?
- * Are there particular locations in which "apocalypticism" seems to have flourished more than in others?
- * Is there evidence that apocalyptic ideas circulated outside of circles influenced by Judaism?

3. Getting Oriented to the Significant Events [see also 1b, above]

Identify four different **key EVENTS** that helped shape the development of early Christian apocalyptic texts or concepts and conjecture how such developments might have influenced (or created) "apocalyptically oriented" followers of Jesus.

[Suggestion: look for turning points suggested by the organization of the Secondary Syntheses]

Further questions of historical development:

- * How did "apocalypticism" deal with the Jewish calamities of the first two centuries?
- * How did "apocalypticism" react to persecution of Christians by Rome?
- * Can we hope to learn anything from similar modern reactions to crises?

4. Getting Oriented to the ONLOOKERS and OPPONENTS

Identify four types of non-"apocalyptic" contemporaries (at least two of which are also non-Christian) in the early period (up to about 306 CE) and describe each position vis-a-vis "apocalyptic" Christianity. Do the same for four specific individuals.

[Suggestion: pay special attention to "backgrounds" treatments in the Secondary Syntheses (e.g. on [Greco-Roman](#) and on [Jewish](#) aspects), and follow up in the Secondary [Anthologies](#); e.g. familiarize yourself with the philosophical schools and religious options, as well as [such sources](#) as: [Philo](#) ([Hypothetica](#), on [Human Freedom](#) and on the [Contemplative Life](#)), Josephus (on Palestinian [Jewish groups](#) [see [also](#)]), [Lucian of Samosata](#) (on [Alexander of Abonoteichos](#) and [Peregrinus](#)), Philostratus on [Apollonius of Tyana](#) (also [here](#))]

Some further observations and questions:

- * Why did the "anti-chiliasm" have such objections to "apocalyptic"?
- * How appropriate was the attempt by certain Christian authors to identify "apocalypticism" with Judaistic perspectives?

5. Concepts of Jesus, his Origins, and his Relationship to Apocalyptic

Identify four different early Christian explanations of who Jesus is and how he is related to apocalyptic expectations. To what extent have existing "apocalyptic" interests been modified or adjusted in these contexts?

[Suggestions: consider such [passages](#) as GJohn 4.1-42, GMk 12 and parallels in GMt 21-22 and GLk 20,

GMk 13 and parallels,
Acts 2.14-36
Paul/2 Cor 5.16 in context,
1 Timothy 3.16,
Hebrews 6-7,
"GHebrews" [Coptic fragment](#),
[Ascension of Isaiah](#) 11,
GLk 7.1-35 and parallels in GMt 11;
see also Kraft article on [Joshua-Messiah](#)]

6. Jesus as Apocalyptic Revealer

Identify four different ways in which Jesus is depicted as a "revealer" of special "knowledge" and/or material to his disciples (pay attention to chronological [i.e. at what point in his career, broadly speaking] and geographical/physical issues [where, in what forms] as well as to audience and content).

[Suggestions: compare the approaches in such [sources](#) as
Paul (Gal 1.16, 2 Cor 12),
GThomas (and "Q"),
GJohn,
Revelation 1-3,
[Epistle of the Apostles](#) (see 2 Pet 1.16-18),
[Dialogue of the Savior](#) (NHL),
[Sophia of Jesus Christ](#) (NHL),
[Montanus](#),
Clement of Alexandria --]

7. Besides Revealing, what does Jesus do within the framework of Apocalyptic Thought?

What else, besides revealing hidden knowledge, does Jesus do as a participant in the apocalyptic events according to early Christian sources? How would a typical early Christian "apocalyptic" thinker interpret each role or function within the larger context of Christian ideas and expectations (e.g. does Jesus as "judge" operate only at the end of time? does this role differ from Jesus as intercessor? as "savior"?)?

[Suggestions: explore such [passages](#) as
Paul/1 Cor 15 (end time victor),
Paul/Rom 5-8 (victor over sin),
Paul/Gal 2 ("in me"), 3 (curse);
?Paul/Phlp 2.1-13 ("mind");
"Paul"/1 Tim 1.12-2.7,
"Paul"/2 Tim 2.8-13,
"Paul"/Tit 2.11-14;
1 Pet 1;
1 Jn 1.5-2.17;
Heb 1-2 (pioneer), 5, 7.20-8.13, 12.1-11;
GJn 1.1-18 (logos), 6.35-65 (nourishment), 17 (model?), 19 (kingdom);
Rev (lamb);
ApcrJn start (NH -- and other materials mentioned above under #6);
1 Clem 36;
Barn 8 (scapegoat);

8. Institutionalizing/Domesticating the [Apocalyptic Impetus](#)

Explore the use and meanings in [early Christian writings](#) of such terms as "kingdom of God/Heavens," "parousia," "second coming" or "return" of Christ, "last days/times," "antichrist" and related imagery, "day of the Lord" (or "of judgment"), and the like. How do the non-apocalyptic sources handle such terms and ideas?

[Suggestions: use a concordance for NT and Apostolic Fathers;

look at Paul/1 Cor 7, 15;

?Paul/1 Thess 5;

GMk 8.34-9.1 (and parallels);

"Paul"/1 Tim 4;

2 Pet 3; Heb 1;

Rev 22;

[Didache 16](#);

[2 Clem 17](#);

[Diognetus 5](#)]

OR

Identify four instances in which apparent frustration of apocalyptic hopes led to the modification of existing ideas/practices or the development of new ideas/practices in early Christian circles.

[Suggestions: explore the implications of the synoptic "transfiguration" accounts (compare 2 Pet 1),

Paul/1 Cor 15 (resurrection past),

?Paul/1 Thess 4-5 (end anticipation),

1 Jn (antichrist),

2 Pet (delay of end);

consider how early Christians related "kingdom of God" to human institutions or to citizenship ideals]

9. Patterns of [Liturgy/Cult](#)

Identify four different early Christian community practices or ritual developments, and be prepared to discuss the background of at least one of them and their use in "apocalyptic" circles.

[[Suggestions](#):

Paul, [1 Corinthians](#) 5, 8-11,

Paul, [Romans](#) 6.1-11,

[Didache](#) (entire -- see also its [relationship to Barnabas](#)),

[Hebrews](#) 3.13 and 10.25 & [Barnabas](#) 4.10 (avoid isolation),

[Pliny to Trajan](#) (what Christians actually do),

[1 John](#) 1.9 (confession?) and *passim*, on (not) sinning ,

[James](#) 5.13-20,

[Justin](#), Apology 61-67,

[Gospel of Philip](#) [Nag Hammadi] 64-71,

synoptic sending out of the 12 (GMark 6.7ff and [parallels](#)) and/or the 70 (G[Luke](#) 10),

G[Matthew](#) 28 "great commission"]

10. Patterns of [Study, Connectedness, Rationalization](#)

Early Christians imitated, adapted and created various approaches and arguments in defense and/or

explanation of their positions. What patterns and principles of interpretation and presentation are recognizable in the following [examples](#) (focus especially on "apocalyptic" approaches or orientations):
Paul, [Romans](#) 9-11 (what about Judaism, finally?)
[GMatthew](#) 1-2 (fulfilment texts), 5.17-48 ("fences" around the laws)
[Revelation/Apocalypse](#) 13 (compare 4 Ezra [2 Esdras] 11-12) (Jewish apocalyptic traditions)
[1 Clement](#) 7-12 (heroes of the Jewish tradition as models)
[Barnabas](#) 7-8 (Jewish liturgy typology), 9-10 ("real" circumcision), 18-20 ("Two Ways" ethic)
[Didache 3](#) ("fences" around the laws)
[Justin](#), Dialogue with Trypho 1-7 (searching for "truth")
[Origin of the World](#) [Nag Hammadi] (start) (cosmogony through philosophical mythology)

[Suggestions: Be alert to patterns that might suggest educational influences, "school type" activities, philosophizing commonplaces, scriptural associations/allusions, and the like]

11. Patterns of [Social Involvement and/or Withdrawal](#)

In what ways, and for what reasons, did early "apocalyptic" Christians attempt to distance themselves from the world in which they found themselves and in what ways did they acknowledge and affirm it? Pay attention to attitudes regarding social contacts and meetings, citizenship, military service, attendance at theater and/or the games and banquets (note accusations of misanthropy, atheism, secret orgies, and the like).

[[Suggestions](#):

Paul, [Galatians](#) 5-6.10 (eschatological mysticism and ethical admonition)
Paul, [1 Corinthians](#) 7 (marriage advice in the last days)
Paul, [Romans](#) 13 (don't rock the boat -- obey the civic authorities, pay taxes)
"Paul," [1 Timothy](#) 4-6 (too much of too little is too bad -- practice community order)
[Hebrews](#) 13 (show hospitality, live orderly and restrained)
[1 Peter](#) 1-4 ("Haustafel" ethics, in and out of the community; see also "Paul's" Colossians-Ephesians)
[1 John](#) 4-5 (avoid deception, overcome the world)
[Revelation/Apocalypse](#) 22.6-21 (the time is at hand -- how to act)
[Didache](#) (a handbook of basic ethics, liturgy, end time expectation)
[Justin](#) (accusations) (Christian atheism, cannibalism, sexual excesses, etc.)
[2 Clement](#) 5-7 (exhortations in the shadow of the end)
[Diognetus](#) 5-6 (Christianity within the ordinary world)
see also [Marcion](#) (following the God of love, not the God of justice),
[Tertullian](#) (and [Montanism](#)) (radical living awaiting the radical end),
"enkratism" ([Tatian](#)) (avoid anything beyond the bare necessities)]

12. Synthetic [Overview](#)

Reconstruct four different uses of "apocalyptic" Christianity in the early period and show how each has its own identity/personality in relation to the others, to non-"apocalyptic" Christian groups, and to the extra-Christian worlds. Try to choose varieties sufficiently different from each other that they probably would have argued (or did argue) strongly (or at least loudly) against each other.

[Suggestion: review all the relevant materials and imagine how each position would relate to the others.]

Selected Bibliography:

The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism, ed. John J. Collins and Bernard McGinn (3 vols; Continuum 1998).

Mitchell G. Reddish, ed.. *Apocalyptic Literature. A Reader* (Abingdon 1990; Hendrickson 1995). [A selection of Jewish and early Christian apocalyptic texts with brief commentary.]

John J. Collins, *The Apocalyptic Imagination: An Introduction to Jewish Apocalyptic Literature*. 2nd edition. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998.

John J. Collins, editor. *Apocalyptic: The Morphology of a Genre*. *Semeia* 14 (1979)

Some other relevant works, in reverse chronological order:

Boustan, Ra'Anan S. and Annette Yoshiko Reed, editors, *Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004) pp. xiii + 335.

- [Review](#)

Grabbe, Lester L, Robert D Haak (eds)

Knowing the End From the Beginning: The Prophetic, Apocalyptic, and their Relationship (JSP Supplement 46; T & T Clark International, 2003). Pp. xii + 226.

Much study has taken place of the prophetic and apocalyptic writings in recent decades, but the relationship between the two has been little explored. A major explicit debate on the question is very much needed and is now provided. This collection of essays addresses the subject from a variety of points of view, including studies on the issues of definitions, ancient Near Eastern "prophecies", social anthropology and modern apocalyptic movements. In the introduction, Lester Grabbe argues that many scholars operate with subconscious assumptions about how apocalyptic writings relate to the prophetic writings, but that many of these assumptions now need to be questioned in the light of the essays in this volume. Such a comprehensive attempt to tackle the main theoretical issues arising from the study of the prophetic and the apocalyptic has not been attempted for some time. This volume brings fresh questions and insights that both specialists and students will want to consider.

- [Review](#)

Pate, C. Marvin and Douglas W. Kennard. *Deliverance Now and Not Yet: The New Testament and the Great Tribulation*, Studies in Biblical Literature 54. New York: Peter Lang, 2003.

Dubis, Mark. *Messianic Woes in First Peter: Suffering and Eschatology in 1 Peter 4:12-19*, Studies in Biblical Literature 33. New York: Peter Lang, 2002.

- [Review](#)

Duff, Paul B. *Who Rides the Beast? Prophetic Rivalry and the Rhetoric of Crisis in the Churches of the Apocalypse*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.

- [Review](#)

Friesen, Steven J. *Imperial Cults and the Apocalypse of John: Reading Revelation in the Ruins*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Norman Cohn, *Cosmos, Chaos and the World To Come: The Ancient Roots of Apocalyptic Faith*. 2nd edition. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001 [1993].

Carroll, John T. et al., ed. *The Return of Jesus in Early Christianity*. Peabody, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 2000.

Court, John M. *The Book of Revelation and the Johannine Apocalyptic Tradition*, JSNTSup 190. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 2000.

- Malina, Bruce J. *The New Jerusalem in the Revelation of John*, Zacchaeus Studies, New Testament. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 2000.
- Ehrman, Bart D. *Jesus, Apocalyptic Prophet of the New Millennium*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Frances Carey, ed., *The Apocalypse and the Shape of Things to Come*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999.
- Rossing, Barbara R. *The Choice Between Two Cities: Whore, Bride and Empire in the Apocalypse*, Harvard Theological Studies 48. Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: Trinity Press International, 1999.
- Sacchi, Paolo. *Jewish Apocalyptic and Its History*, JSOTSup 20. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999
- Bauckham, Richard. *The Fate of the Dead: Studies on the Jewish and Christian Apocalypses*, Novum Testamentum Supplement 93. Leiden: Brill, 1998.
- Collins, John J. *Jerusalem and the Temple in Jewish Apocalyptic Literature of the Second Temple Period*, International Rennert Guest Lecture 1. Ramat Gan: Bar-Ilan University Press, 1998.
- Oegema, Gerbern S. *The Anointed and His People: Messianic Expectations from the Maccabees to Bar Kochba*, JSPSup 27. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998.
- Collins, John J. *Seers, Sibyls and Sages in Hellenistic-Roman Judaism*, SupJSJ 54. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1997.
- Collins, John J. *Apocalypticism in the Dead Sea Scrolls*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Carrell, Peter R. *Jesus and the Angels: Angelology and the Christology of the Apocalypse of John*, SNTSMS 95. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997. [review by Adrian Austin]
- Hill, Robert Allan,
An examination and critique of the understanding of the relationship between apocalypticism and gnosticism in Johannine studies (Lewiston, N.Y.: Mellen University Press, c1997). Pp. iii, 258. [review by Liz Rosado]
- S. L. Cook, *Prophecy and Apocalypticism*. (Augsburg Fortress 1996). [Connects apocalyptic writings with priestly groups in power, not with disenfranchised groups as Hanson does.]
- Collins, Adela Yarbro. *Cosmology and Eschatology in Jewish and Christian Apocalypticism*, SupJSJ 50. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.
- Holman, Charles L. *Till Jesus Comes: The Origins of Christian Apocalyptic Expectation*. Peabody, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 1996.
- Peerbolte, L. J. Lietaert. *The Antecedents of Antichrist: A Traditio-Historical Study of the Earliest Christian Views on Eschatological Opponents*, SupJSJ. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.
- Trevett, Christine. *Montanism: Gender, Authority and the New Prophecy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996. [review by Kat Korzow]
- James C. VanderKam and William Adler, editors, *The Jewish Apocalyptic Heritage in Early Christianity (Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum Ad Novum Testamentum 3.4, Jewish Traditions in Early Christianity; Fortress/van Gorkum 1996)*.

[The volume contains five chapters which investigate the early Christian appropriations of Jewish apocalyptic material. An introductory chapter surveys ancient perceptions of the apocalypses as

well as their function, authority, and survival in the early Church. The second chapter focuses on a specific tradition by exploring the status of the Enoch-literature, the use of the fallen-angel motif, and the identification of Enoch as an eschatological witness. Christian transmission of Jewish texts, a topic whose significance is more and more being recognized, is the subject of chapter three which analyzes what happened to 4,5 and 6 Ezra as they were copied and edited in Christian circles. Chapter four studies the early Christian appropriation and reinterpretation of Jewish apocalyptic chronologies, especially Daniel's vision of 70 weeks. The fifth and last chapter is devoted to the use and influence of Jewish apocalyptic traditions among Christian sectarian groups in Asia Minor and particularly in Egypt. Taken together these chapters written by four authors, offer illuminating examples of how Jewish apocalyptic texts and traditions fared in early Christianity" (publisher's blurb).]

Collins, John J. *The Scepter and the Star: The Messiahs of the Dead Sea Scrolls and Other Ancient Literature*, ABRL. New York: Doubleday, 1995.

Cook, Stephen L. *Prophecy and Apocalypticism: The Postexilic Social Setting*. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1995.

Bernstein, Alan E. *The Formation of Hell: Death and Retribution in the Ancient and Early Christian Worlds*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1993.

Himmelfarb, Martha. *Ascent to Heaven in Jewish and Christian Apocalypses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1993.

Hill, Charles Evan. *Regnum Caelorum: Patterns of Future Hope in Early Christianity*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.

Russell, David Syme. *Divine Disclosure: An Introduction to Jewish Apocalyptic*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1992.

Kvanvig, Helge S. *Roots of Apocalyptic: The Mesopotamian Background of the Enoch Figure and of the Son of Man*, WMANT 61. Keukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener, 1988.

P. D. Hanson, *Old Testament Apocalyptic*. Interpreting Biblical Texts Series (Abingdon 1987).

Juel, Donald. *Messianic Exegesis: Christological Interpretation of the Old Testament in Early Christianity*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987.

Alexander, Paul J. *The Byzantine Apocalyptic Tradition*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985. [review by Seville G. Mannickarottu, 15 Nov 2005]

Beale, Gregory K. *The Use of Daniel in Jewish Apocalyptic Literature and in the Revelation of St. John*. Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America, 1984.

VanderKam, James C. *Enoch and the Growth of an Apocalyptic Tradition*, Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monography Series 16. Washington, D. C.: Catholic Biblical Association, 1984.

Aune, David Edward. *Prophecy in Early Christianity and the Ancient Mediterranean World*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1983.

Himmelfarb, Martha. *Tours of Hell: An Apocalyptic Form in Jewish and Christian Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1983.

S. Niditch, *The Symbolic Vision in Biblical Tradition*. Harvard Semitic Monographs 30 (Scholars 1983)

C. Rowland, *The Open Heaven: A Study of Apocalyptic in Judaism and Early Christianity* (Crossroad 1982).

R. R. Wilson, "From Prophecy to Apocalyptic: Reflections on the Shape of Israelite Religion." *Semeia* 21 (1981) 79-95.

D. S. Russell, *Apocalyptic: Ancient and Modern* (Fortress 1978). [Condensed from his 1964 book, with special attention to the enduring significance of apocalyptic literature.]

Gager, John G. *Kingdom and Community: The Social World of Early Christianity*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1975.

W. Schmithals, *The Apocalyptic Movement* (Abingdon 1975).

P. D. Hanson, *The Dawn of Apocalyptic. The Historical and Sociological Roots of Jewish Apocalyptic Eschatology*. (Fortress 1975). [Finds the roots of apocalypticism in a disenfranchised group associated with the Jerusalem temple.]

Collins, John J. *The Sibylline Oracles of Egyptian Judaism*, 1972. See also his article in 2004: "The Third Sibylline Revisited" [review by Caroline Kelly, Nov 29th]

Levey, Samson H. *The Messiah: An Aramaic Interpretation; The Messianic Exegesis of the Targum*. Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion, 1974.

K. Koch, *The Rediscovery of Apocalyptic* (SCM 1972).

Aune, David Edward. *The Cultic Setting of Realized Eschatology in Early Christianity*, NovTSup 28. Leiden, Brill, 1972.

Hartman, Lars. *Prophecy Interpreted: The Formation of Some Jewish Apocalyptic Texts and of the Eschatological Discourse in Mark 13 particularly*, trans. Neil Tomkinson. Lund: CWK Gleerup Lund, 1966.

D. S. Russell, *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic: 200 B.C.-A.D. 100* (Westminster 1964).

Klausner, Joseph. *The Messianic Idea in Israel, from Its Beginning to the Completion of the Mishnah*, 3d Hebrew edition, trans. W. F. Stinespring. New York: Macmillan, 1955; Hebrew original.

H. H. Rowley, *The Relevance of Apocalyptic* (Lutterworth 1944).

See also the "[Apocalypse and Millennium](#)" [Bibliography](#) by Ted Daniels

Catherine Murphy's [Bibliography](#)

Online courses in similar topics:

<http://www.philipharland.com/RELI629QApocalypticism.html> (Philip A. Harland)

<http://myweb.lmu.edu/fjust/THST398Apoc.htm> (Felix Just)

<http://www.theology.edu/apocaly.htm> (Jim West)

http://myweb.lmu.edu/fjust/Apocalyptic_Links.htm (Felix Just)

(see also above for Catherine Murphy's course, "[Apocalypse Now](#)")

[[Last modified: 03/21/2018 11:32:40]]

[[Last modified: 11/15/2005 13:45:33]]

